

Ulrike Hascher-Burger, *Introduction*

Welcome everybody to our panel *Reforming faith: continuity and disruption in the uses of music*. As you already noticed in the program, this panel is based on the ongoing research program *Sound Memories: The Musical Past in Late-Medieval and Early-Modern Europe*, funded by HERA (Humanities in the European Research Area)

For today's Europeans, the existence of a collective musical past is a given. The past is heard and negotiated in the concert hall, and when we listen to or perform popular 'oldies'; countless political and emotional narratives are attached to it, demonstrating the extent to which the musical past can be instrumentalised. Our project explores the mechanisms by which Europeans of a distant past (c. 1200-1600) used collective musical memory to shape cultural and political behaviour.

Three speakers of this panel, Inga Mai Groote, Manon Louviot, and Christine Roth, as well as I myself, are participants in the HERA project. Fañch Thoraval is a guest from the forthcoming project *Sonore religieux et interdit musical dans les réformes canoniales à l'époque pré-tridentine* (FNRS, October 2017-September 2020). We are very happy he accepted our invitation to join us in this session.

The common theme which connects the papers in this session is our general interest in the mechanisms of reforming and maintaining, a tension that can be noticed in late medieval reforms as well as in 16th century Lutheran Reformation. Manon Louviot and Fanch Thoraval deal with late medieval reforms in northern Germany and northern Italy, both describing the tension between prohibition and tradition. Inga Mai Groote and Christine Roth investigate the relationship between 'old' and 'new' music transmitted in the Lutheran regions of 16th-century Germany.

Manon Louviot: *Regulating Processions in Reformed Augustinian Convents of Lower Saxony*

Liturgical processions were an important, carefully organized component of the medieval worship, which varied depending on the location and the religious context. Their use is of particular interest within female monasteries of Lower Saxony, where a monastic reform carried out by the Congregation of Windesheim was implemented in the middle of the 15th-century. Indeed, the constitutions of the female houses of Windesheim stipulate that canonesses do not perform processions, thus breaking with the long-established practice of processions. However, sources from reformed convents – though not necessarily incorporated within the Congregation – attest that canonesses maintained this practice. In particular, two processionalists from the convents of Steterburg and Heiningen as well as an ordinary from Heiningen (today in the Herzog August Bibliothek in Wolfenbüttel, respectively D-W 1028, D-W 875 and D-W 649) give detailed information on music, movement and gestures for processions on feast-days. Focusing on these two convents, this paper aims at investigating the value of regulations in relation to the objectives for change of the reformers and to the continuing practice of processions.

Ulrike Hascher-Burger: *Response to Manon Louviot's paper*

Prohibiting liturgical processions in female houses was not the only aspect of the Windesheim liturgical reform. Other prohibitions dealt with the liturgical use of polyphony and the use of organs. Prohibiting organs was not an idea original to Windesheim, while the prohibition of processions for female houses is not known to me from other reform circles. But

both prohibitions were not very successful. In 1464, the General Chapter of Windesheim decided to ban organs in the Divine Office as well as in the dormitory, in liturgy thus and in para-liturgy. They did not succeed: until 1545 various interdictions were pronounced, each one a little bit less strict than its predecessor. The last one prohibited convents without organs from acquiring this instrument. Houses already possessing organs could go on with organ music, but the instrument was not allowed to be played by a professed person. Especially female convents in Lower Saxony, reformed by Windesheim or Bursfelde, were not inclined to obey these restrictions readily, just like they possibly did not conform to the prohibition of processions either. They repaired already existing organs and even built new ones. This is a fascinating observation showing again the potential of political insubordination of canonesses and nuns during a reform which was often imposed on them against their own will.

Fañch Thoraval: *Music Prohibitions and Regular Reformation: The Case of the Canons of San Salvatore*

The idea of reformation has occurred all through the Church history with such a frequency that it has been considered as one of its structuring criteria. Beyond theological issues, one of its major purposes has certainly been to overhaul the religious behaviors and practices of both the clergy and the lay people. It has long been observed that the regulations produced during these reformation processes often implied restrictions – or even prohibitions – to the use of polyphony (or at least to specific kinds of polyphony). Whereas the implications of this “musical skepticism” have mostly been discussed from the moral and devotional points of view, they prove to be more complex and varied. Indeed, the control of musical activities can be motivated by many other requirements, whether they are material (e.g. to restrict expenses), social (e.g. to maintain the community’s cohesion) or ritual (e.g. to define liturgical spaces, times and structures). Furthermore, these regulations do not apply homogeneously since their implications and limitations depend on many factors such as the hierarchical status of the regulations themselves. Finally, by producing a distinction between licit and illicit musical activities, they make it possible to define an “aural idiom” that can be specifically linked with the subjected social group.

Consequently, when formulated within the reformation of a religious order, a musical prohibition cannot be understood as the result of a simple cultural conservatism or aural iconoclasm. It has to be considered as a part of a wider program which scope is not only to control the behaviors of the individuals and to organize their religious activities, but also to define “aurally” their status as a community. In order to evaluate the modalities and scope of this phenomenon in the reformation of a religious order, this paper will analyze the juridical documentation (statutes, ordinaries and capitular acts) provided by the Congregazione di San Salvatore, an Italian congregation of reformed Augustinian canons initiated at the end of the Papal Schism which eventually became an important example for the regular canonic “*arctior vita*”.

Ulrike Hascher-Burger: Response to Fañch Thoraval’s paper

Not only the canons of San Salvatore, but the Augustinian canons and canonesses of the Chapter of Windesheim were also forbidden to sing polyphony in liturgy. The oldest source of the Windesheim Ordinarius already banned rhythmical melodies. Reason for the ban was the *fractio vocis*, which could cause *curiositas* and *levitas*. That means singers singing with *fractio vocis* could be distracted by the music itself (*curiositas*) and seduced to superficial cheerfulness (*levitas*). Instead, chant should be realized *plano et simplici modo*, without rhythm and without ornamentation. This could point to *cantus fractus*, the rhythmical execution of chant often

found in late medieval sources of Central Europe, which indeed – as far as I know – is not found in liturgical sources from Windesheim. But more probably it is written against the polyphonic art music of the time, the motets and masses with several texts and their complicated and so appealing music. Indeed, from Windesheim circles we only know simple polyphony, up to a maximum of three voices, written in a quite syllabic and homophone style. The text was of primary importance, whilst music only served as a vehicle for delivering the contents of the text. Only during Christmas, the reins were slackened a bit, as some Christmas songs from the Modern Devotion were a little less syllabic and homophone. But they still were simple.

Christine Roth: *Constructing authority and identity through tradition and change: The manuscript Luneburg KN 150*

In music historiography the consequences of the Reformation for German musical culture in the 16th century have often been described as a rupture with traditional repertory and church music practice. However, Lutheran music practice and musical repertory – as is reflected in collections and in written accounts of music – are of course indebted to pre-Reformation church music. Some sources of Northern German cities are significant examples of a musical culture preserving traditions whilst adapting them to the needs of the new born confession. The case of K.N. 150, a Luneburg motet collection, is of particular interest as the scribes continuously noted the date of entry, thereby giving an insight into the development of the repertory over a fifty-year period. Not only is the presence of Latin chants in Lutheran music collections symptomatic for the continuity in that repertory but the ongoing distribution of pre-Reformation polyphonic music at the end of the century testifies a need for anchorage in tradition. The Lutheran music collections reflect the construction of a Lutheran tradition and identity that is different from that of the Roman church but nevertheless remains in the tradition of Christian culture and they enable an assessment of how continuity and disruption confer authority to the Lutheran music repertory in the uses of music as well as in its transmission.

Ulrike Hacher-Burger: Response to Christine Roth's paper

In my response I would like to draw your attention again to convents. In Lower Saxony, houses that formerly belonged to the Cistercian, Benedictine or Augustinian order have been serving as female Lutheran convents for nearly 500 years, supervised by a Lutheran abbess. Their existence up until this day is itself an illustration of the continuation of tradition in Northern Germany. Moreover, this phenomenon allows us to directly compare song habits before and after the Reformation in these circles. Several interesting sources have survived, for instance prayerbooks in Medingen from before the Reformation, and prayerbooks in Walsrode from the period after the Reformation. These prayerbooks provide interesting information about songs for meditation. Upon comparison, it becomes obvious that in these convents the transition from late medieval to Lutheran song repertory has been abrupt. Only very few and well known medieval songs continued to be sung during the office. The Ambrosian hymn *Te Deum laudamus* at the end of Matins, and the Magnificat at the end of Vespers were fixed moments of medieval liturgy that continued in the Lutheran Office – translated into German. Some vernacular songs that had been sung already in the late Middle Ages, such as *Christ ist erstanden* and *Gelobet seist du Jesu Christ*, found their way in Lutheran songbooks as well. But for most of the music in these convents, the medieval hymn tradition came to an end with the introduction of the Lutheran reformation. Other than in the polyphonic sources investigated by Christine, the rupture in the liturgical repertory of these convents was quite definite.

Inga Mai Groote: “Zwen lateinischs psalmen”: Resilience and Change in Reforming Musical Practices in Heilbronn

The implementation of protestant reforms in German towns and territories usually relied on the interaction of different groups (population, preachers, the town council etc.) and was the result of negotiations between these interest groups. Hence, an interpretation of the underlying strategies and goals has to rely on detailed case studies. In many cases, the changes in liturgical ritual were by no means intended to be radical, nor can they be understood as a form of ‘modernization’, but they aimed instead at maintaining and expurgating established, authoritative practices, among them Latin chant, if suitable choristers were available. This can be well studied in the case of imperial cities, and Heilbronn, where the Reformation movement was led by Johannes Lachmann and Kaspar Gräter, offers interesting material: documents like the justification of the city on the Imperial Diet of 1530, several drafts for local church orders, and especially the ‘Ordnung des Kirchengesangs’ (1543) with detailed instructions for the (Latin) chants to be used. These sources allow discussing the process of adjusting the liturgical use of music against general characteristics of the Reformation in Southern Germany and give insight into the positioning of the newly established confession against the tradition of the Roman church.

Ulrike Hascher-Burger: Response to Inga Mai Groote’s paper:

Having lived in the Netherlands already for many years, the first thought which comes to my mind when it comes to psalms and reformation is that of the Genevan Psalter, the only permitted liturgical music after the Calvinist reformation. A complete corpus of 150 psalms and some biblical cantica, with rhymed vernacular texts based on the bible. Other than in Lutheran Germany, the introduction of the Reformation in the Netherlands resulted in a definite rupture with the medieval music culture. In Calvinist services – and only they were officially allowed - all was strictly forbidden: Latin, polyphony, organs, and processions. And all was replaced by a super modern collection of rhymed psalms which is being sung in Dutch Calvinist services until today. I think this was the “egg of Columbus”: not fruitlessly trying to ban the old liturgy, or carefully adapt several elements of it, but replacing it with a new, modern, high level texted and composed corpus from Geneva. This corpus spread all over the world within a short time, from America to Asia, and it was translated into many languages. In the Netherlands, the Roman liturgy went underground, officially forbidden as it was until the 19th century.

The question is to what extent reforms are successful when they are based only on prohibition or adaptation. The example of the Genevan Psalter suggests that the implementation of a completely new alternative allows reform to become widely accepted.